



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 20, 2007

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086

OR2007-15319

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 295248.

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request from a social worker with the Family Court Services division of the Dallas County Domestic Relations Office for all police records pertaining to two named individuals. We understand that you will withhold some of the requested information relating to a pending criminal case based upon the ruling in *Attorney General v. Plano Police Department*, No. GV-001919 (126th Dist.Ct., Travis County, Tex., December 18, 2000). You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You state the request for "all police records" requires the department to compile the criminal history of the named individuals. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *Id.*

at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

In this instance, however, we note that the requestor, as the authorized representative of the two named individuals, has a special right of access to information pertaining to the named individuals under section 552.023 of the Government Code. Section 552.023 gives a person or a person's authorized representative a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Therefore, we conclude that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Exhibit C consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.001(1)(E). Thus, the information falls within the scope of section 261.201(a). You have not indicated that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we find that Exhibit C is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and is generally excepted from public disclosure

pursuant to section 552.101. However, section 261.201 also provides that information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id* § 261.201(a).

We note that chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.1285(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] domestic relations office created under Chapter 203, Family Code, is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information that relates to a person who is a subject of a social study under Subchapter D, Chapter 107, Family Code.”¹ *See* Gov’t Code § 411.1285(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)(2). We note that “criminal history record information” is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Thus, the information at issue contains “criminal history record information.” However, a domestic relations office that receives criminal history record information from a criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for purposes of conducting a social study under subsection D, chapter 107 of the Family Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, if the requestor in this instance is a domestic relations office created under chapter 203 of the Family Code, it is authorized to obtain criminal history record information that relates to a person who is the subject of a social study under chapter 107 of the Family Code from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

¹A “domestic relations office” is defined as “a county office that serves families, county departments, and courts to ensure effective implementation of this title.” Fam. Code § 203.001(2). Additionally, a district court “may order the preparation of a social study into the circumstances and condition of the child and of the home of any person requesting managing conservatorship or possession of the child.” Fam. Code § 107.051(a).

The department received the request from the Dallas County Family Court Services (the "DCFCS"). The requestor states that she has been appointed by the DCFCS "to complete a court ordered social study" involving the named individuals. If the department determines that the DCFCS is conducting a social study under chapter 107 of the Family Code and that disclosure of Exhibit C is consistent with the Family Code in this instance, then we find that the department must make available to the requestor information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that case, the department must withhold the remainder of Exhibit C from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

However, if the department determines that the DCFCS does not intend to use criminal history record information from the submitted information for the purpose of conducting a social study under chapter 107 or that disclosure of the information is not consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the Exhibit C in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g) (listing entities authorized to receive 261.201 information); *see also* Attorney General Opinions DM-353 at 4 n. 6 (1995) (finding interagency transfer of information prohibited where confidentiality statute enumerates specific entities to which release of information is authorized and where potential receiving governmental body is not among statute's enumerated entities), JM-590 at 4-5 (1986); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

We note that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We have marked the information that must be withheld under section 552.130.

In summary, if the department determines that the DCFCS intends to use the criminal history record information in Exhibit C for purposes of conducting a social study under chapter 107 and that disclosure of such information is consistent with the Family Code, the department must make available to the requestor the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that case, the department must withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. In the event the department

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 of the Government Code on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

determines that the DCFCS does not intend to use the criminal history record information in Exhibit C for purposes of conducting a social study or that disclosure of such information is not consistent with the Family Code, the department must withhold Exhibit C in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

³We note that some of the information being released is confidential and not subject to release to the general public. However, the requestor in this instance has a special right of access to the information. Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department should again seek our decision.

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Paige Savoie
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PS/ma

Ref: ID# 295248

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Diane Zylka, LMSW
600 Commerce Street #201
Dallas, Texas 75202-6635
(w/o enclosures)