



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 27, 2007

Ms. Jude Andrepont
Assistant Records Supervisor
Beaumont Police Department
P.O. Box 3827
Beaumont, Texas 77704-3827

OR2007-17030

Dear Ms. Andrepont:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 300354.

The Beaumont Police Department (the "department") received a request for thirty-three specified offense reports. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that some of the information you have submitted to us for review is not responsive to the request for information. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the department is not required to release this information, which we have marked, in response to this request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed).

You assert that the responsive information is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a) provides the following:

Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication

Gov't Code § 552.108(a). Subsection 552.108(a)(1) protects information that pertains to a specific pending criminal investigation or prosecution. In contrast, subsection 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication.

You state that the submitted information “*may* also relate to on-going criminal cases.” (emphasis added). You also inform us that “several different levels and types of searches may . . . be required to ascertain whether anything submitted . . . may . . . relate to an on-going criminal case or a case that has not resulted in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]”¹ However, you have not identified which of the submitted offense reports, if any, pertains to a pending criminal investigation; therefore, the department has failed to establish that any of the submitted reports is excepted under section 552.108(a)(1). *See id.* 552.301(e)(2) (governmental body must label copy of requested information to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the copy). You also have not identified which of the submitted reports, if any, pertains to a case that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication; therefore, the department has also failed to establish that any of the submitted reports is excepted under section 552.108(a)(2). *See id.* Accordingly, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

You assert that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007(c) provides as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

¹We note that the administrative inconvenience involved in responding to a request for information does not excuse a failure to comply with the Act. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (1976) (cost or difficulty of complying with the Act does not determine availability of information); Open Records Decision No. 497 (1988).

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Offense reports 2004-011139, 2004-012105, and 2004-021266 contain information that involves juvenile conduct occurring after September 1, 1997. None of the exceptions in section 58.007 appears to apply. Therefore, offense reports 2004-011139, 2004-012105, and 2004-021266 are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the department must withhold them under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses former section 51.14 of the Family Code. Prior to its repeal by the Seventy-fourth Legislature, section 51.14(d) of the Family Code provided for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records. Law enforcement records pertaining to conduct occurring before January 1, 1996, are governed by the former section 51.14(d), which was continued in effect for that purpose. Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, § 100, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517, 2591. Offense report 1995-005357 concerns juvenile conduct that occurred prior to January 1, 1996. Therefore, this information is confidential under the former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code and must be withheld from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The information in offense reports 1998-003560, 2004-000643, 2004-011801, 2004-011203, and 2004-023082 was used or developed in investigations under chapter 261; therefore, this information is within the scope of section 261.201. You do not indicate that the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Based on this assumption, we conclude that offense reports 1998-003560, 2004-000643, 2004-011801, 2004-011203, and 2004-023082 are confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the department must withhold them under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). Medical records must be released upon the patient’s signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* §§ 159.004, 159.005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). We have marked the portion of the remaining information that constitutes medical records and that may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses Chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides for the confidentiality of records created or maintained by a mental health professional. Section 611.002(a) states that “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.” Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *Id.* § 611.001(b). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). We have marked

the information that constitutes mental health records, and that may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). We have marked the information that is confidential under common-law privacy and that the department must withhold under section 552.101.

We note that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.

The remaining information also contains account numbers. Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." The department must withhold the account numbers we have marked under section 552.136.

To conclude, the marked medical records may only be released in accordance with the MPA and the marked mental health records may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the following under section 552.101 of the Government Code: offense reports 2004-011139, 2004-012105, and 2004-021266 under section 58.007 of the Family Code; offense report 1995-005357 under the former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code; offense reports 1998-003560, 2004-000643, 2004-011801, 2004-011203, and 2004-023082 under section 261.201 of the Family Code; and the information marked under common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information marked under sections 552.130

and 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining responsive information to the requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

²We note that the submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jh

Ref: ID# 300354

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Michael J. Trunelae
Orgain Bell & Tucker, LLP
P.O. Box 1751
Beaumont, Texas 77704-1751
(w/o enclosures)