



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

March 14, 2008

Lt. Jeffrey T. Lyon
Hill County Sheriff's Office
P.O. Box 283
Hillsboro, Texas 76645

OR2008-03418

Dear Lt. Lyon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 305154.

The Hill County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for several categories of information pertaining to two named individuals, as well as information pertaining to other individuals involved in a specified incident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.102 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the sheriff's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. The sheriff received the request for information on December 19, 2007, but you did not request a ruling from this office until January 11, 2008. Thus, the sheriff failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See Gov't Code § 552.302; Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No.319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Section 552.102 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome this presumption; therefore, we will consider the sheriff's claim under this exception.

You assert that the submitted information is subject to section 552.102, which excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). This exception applies when the release of information would result in a violation of the common-law right to privacy. *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Tex. Newspapers*, 652S.W.2d 546 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.). The common-law right to privacy is violated if the information (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts about a person's private affairs, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is of no legitimate concern to the public. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 683-85 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find that you have failed to demonstrate how the submitted information is protected from disclosure by the common-law right to privacy and, thus, it may not be withheld from the requestor under section 552.102 on that basis. See Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (public employee's job performance does not generally constitute his private affairs), 455 (1987) (public employee's job performances or abilities generally not protected by privacy), 444 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees).

We note that some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as Chapter 560 of the Government Code, which provides that a governmental body may not release fingerprint information except in certain limited circumstances. See Gov't Code §§ 560.001 (defining "biometric identifier" to include fingerprints), .002 (prescribing manner in which biometric identifiers must be maintained and circumstances in which they can be released), .003 (providing that biometric identifiers in possession of governmental body are exempt from disclosure under the Act). You do not inform us, and the submitted information does not indicate, that section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information. Therefore, the sheriff must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. The definition of CHRI does not include driving record information maintained by DPS under chapter 521 of the Transportation Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Accordingly, the sheriff must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The submitted information also contains an F-5 form (Report of Separation of License Holder), which is made confidential by section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides in relevant part that "[a] report or statement submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552 of the Government Code." Occ. Code § 1701.454(a). The sheriff must withhold the F-5 form we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

We note that some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is received. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The sheriff may only withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was received. You have provided documentation showing that the two individuals at issue elected to keep their personal information confidential before the sheriff received the request for information; therefore, the sheriff must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) Government Code.

We also note that some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (3). Accordingly, the sheriff must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information and personal identification information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that some of the remaining submitted information appears to be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

In summary, in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code, the sheriff must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 560.003 of the Government Code, the CHRI we have marked under Government Code chapter 411, and the F-5 form we have marked under section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) Government Code, as well as the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released, but any information protected by copyright must be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Allan D. Meesey
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ADM/eeg

Ref: ID# 305154

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jesse M. Granger
203 NE 6th Street
Hubbard, Texas 76648
(w/o enclosures)