



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 31, 2008

Ms. Laura Wright  
Midlothian Police Department  
1150 North Highway 67, Suite 300  
Midlothian, Texas 76065

OR2008-10400

Dear Ms. Wright:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 317465.

The Midlothian Police Department (the "department") received a request for records pertaining to a specified offense report. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. The request reflects that it was received by the department on May 6, 2008, but the department did not request a ruling until May 22, 2008. Thus, the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. Of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Section 552.108

is a discretionary exception and, as such, does not generally provide a compelling reason to withhold information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 522 at 4 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). Generally, a compelling reason exists when third party interests are at stake or the information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). In addition, the need of another governmental body other than the body that has failed to timely seek an open records decision, may be a compelling reason for non-disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991) (presumption of openness rebutted by Department of Public Safety's need to withhold information relating to a criminal investigation pursuant to predecessor provision of section 552.108). Thus, on July 16, 2008, July 22, 2008, and July 30, 2008, this office contacted your office in order to determine whether another governmental body's prosecution interest in withholding the information exists. Because you have not informed us that another governmental body asserts a prosecution interest in withholding the information, we cannot conclude that the department may withhold the information under section 552.108 on that ground. However, section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information. Therefore, we will consider your section 552.101 argument as to whether the submitted information can be withheld from required public disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code. § 58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or

offender. You assert that the submitted information pertains to "juvenile law enforcement records . . . as two juveniles are victims in this report." Upon review, we conclude that the submitted offense report does not involve an identified juvenile as a suspect or offender, and therefore, the submitted offense report is not confidential under section 58.007 and may not be withheld from disclosure on that basis.

We note that the submitted offense report contains motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state."<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, however, that the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Section 552.023(a) provides that "[a] person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023(a). The requestor is the attorney for the suspect. As such, the requestor has the right to access the suspect's Texas motor vehicle record information. However, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jessica J. Maloney  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JJM/mcf

Ref: ID# 317465

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Charles Slaton  
Slaton & Slaton  
200 East Jefferson Street, Suite 1  
Waxahachie, Texas 75165  
(w/o enclosures)