



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 16, 2008

Mr. Christopher D. Taylor
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P. O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2008-17117

Dear Mr. Taylor:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 330078 (City of Waco Reference # LGL-08-935).

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports related to a particular address from 1999 through 2005. You state you have released some of the responsive information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note report number 04-090146 is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note report number 04-090146 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(4)(A) (definition of child neglect includes “leaving of a child in a situation where the child would be exposed to a substantial risk of physical or mental harm, without arranging for necessary care for the child, and the demonstration of an intent not to return by a parent, guardian, or managing or possessory conservator of the child”); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Based on our review, we find report number 04-090146 is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the department must withhold report number 04-090146 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).*

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2). We note that section 552.108(a)(1) and section 552.108(a)(2) typically encompass two mutually exclusive types of information. Section 552.108(a)(1) protects information that pertains to a specific pending criminal investigation or prosecution. In contrast, section 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction

or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body that claims section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A).

You argue that, because the remaining information is open and pending, release of it would interfere with the investigation or prosecution of crime, and it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1). You also argue, however, that the remaining information is related to criminal detection, investigation, or prosecution that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. Because you have provided this office with contradictory information, we find that you have failed to sufficiently demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why claimed exceptions to disclosure apply). We therefore conclude that the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

We note that some information in case number 05-73981, which consists of a report and video, is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Information that tends to identify a victim of sexual assault is protected under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision No. 339* (1982); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Upon review of the information at issue, we find the department must withhold the identifying information of the alleged sexual assault victim we have marked in report number 05-73981 pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We also find that the submitted video is identifying of the victim and must therefore be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that relates to “a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state.” Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, you must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold report number 04-090146 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must withhold the victim's identifying information in report number 05-73981, which we have marked, as well as the submitted video in its entirety, under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas driver's license number we have marked in report number 05-73981 under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must file suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such a challenge, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3). If the governmental body does not file suit over this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can challenge that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

²We note that the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Emily Sitton
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EBS/eb

Ref: ID# 330078

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)