



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 21, 2009

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-00832

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 333353 (Open Records Request 2008-7750).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified charge against a named individual. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments,

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* § 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we agree some of the submitted information is CHRI that falls within the scope of chapter 411. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also incorporates the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987), 455 (1987); and the compilation of an individual’s criminal history, *cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989). However, we note there is generally a legitimate public interest in the details of a criminal investigation. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685 (whether matter is of legitimate interest to the public can be considered only in context of each particular case). Upon review, we find none of the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing or is of no legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, none of the information may be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Next, you claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from required public disclosure pursuant to section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a). Generally speaking, subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(a)(2) are mutually exclusive. Section 552.108(a)(1) protects information, the release of which would interfere with a pending criminal investigation or prosecution, while section 552.108(a)(2) applies only to information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You have marked the information the department seeks to withhold under section 552.108. You state the information relates to a pending investigation and prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude release of the marked information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You have also marked portions of the information you contend are protected from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license number you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information you have marked

under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Katherine M. Kroll
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KMK/eeg

Ref: ID# 333353

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)