



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

March 5, 2009

Ms. YuShan Chang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2009-02915

Dear Ms. Chang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 336564.

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for "the top three (3) winning proposals for HIV prevention grants," as well as the winning proposal for the "media grant." Although you take no position as to the disclosure of the requested information, you state that it may contain proprietary information subject to exception under the Act. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, that the city notified AIDS Foundation Houston, Inc., Busy Bee Learning Academy, Inc., Legacy Community Health Services, and Positive Efforts of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you acknowledge, and we agree, that you failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82

(Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because third-party interests are at stake, we will consider whether the submitted information must be withheld.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this decision, this office has not received any correspondence from AIDS Foundation Houston, Inc., Busy Bee Learning Academy, Inc., Legacy Community Health Services, or Positive Efforts. Thus, these third parties have not demonstrated that any of their information is proprietary for purposes of the Act, and the city may not withhold it on that basis. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. As no exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/eeg

Ref: ID# 336594

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Norman Mitchell
CEO
Busy Bee Learning Academy, Inc.
9898 Bissonnet Street, Suite 680
Houston, Texas 77036
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Barbara Joseph
Positive Efforts
11500 Northwest Freeway, Suite 340
Houston, Texas 77092
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Katy Caldwell
Executive Director
Legacy Community Health Services
P.O. Box 66308
Houston, Texas 77266-6308
(w/o enclosures)

AIDS Foundation Houston, Inc.
3202 Wesleyan Annex
Houston, Texas 77027-5748
(w/o enclosures)