



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 29, 2009

Ms. Susan Camp-Lee
Sheets & Crossfield P. C.
309 East Main Street
Round Rock, Texas 78664-5246

OR2009-05694

Dear Ms. Camp-Lee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 341269.

The Round Rock Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all information pertaining to police or emergency assistance for two specific addresses during a specified time period. You have redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ You state that the department will release some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You claim that the submitted reports at Exhibit B are excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in relevant part the following:

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1). A governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(a)(1) or subsection 552.108(b)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the reports at Exhibit B are related to a current criminal investigations and prosecutions. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that the release of Exhibit B would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to Exhibit B.

We note that basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-8; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

Next, you contend that some of the remaining information is confidential under the doctrine of common-law privacy. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure

²We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of Exhibit B that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

“information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the commission must withhold the criminal history information we have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). Upon review, we find that the additional information we have marked is intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not intimate or embarrassing and is of legitimate public interest. Thus, the department must only withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Next, you claim that a portion of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information that relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information you have marked in Exhibits C and D, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130.

Next, you have highlighted an insurance policy number in the submitted information. Section 552.136 states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b). Accordingly, the department must withhold the insurance policy number you have highlighted under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Next, you contend the e-mail addresses you have marked in the remaining information are subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code. Section 552.137 states that "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]," unless the owner of the e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(b). The types of e-mail addresses listed in section 552.137(c) may not be withheld under this exception. *See id.* § 552.137(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Accordingly, we agree that the department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked, as well as the additional e-mail addresses we have marked, under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses consent to their release.

Next, we note that the remaining information contains information that is subject to chapter 411 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 411.083 of the Government Code. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or

another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). A portion of the remaining information constitutes CHRI. We have marked the information the department must withhold pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that some of the submitted information appears to be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the insurance policy number you have highlighted under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked, as well as the additional e-mail addresses we have marked, under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses consent to their release. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Laura E. Ream
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LER/dls

Ref: ID# 341269

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)