



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 20, 2009

Ms. J. LeAnne Bram Lundy
Feldman, Rogers, Morris & Grover, L.L.P.
5718 Westheimer Road, Suite 1200
Houston, Texas 77057

OR2009-06887

Dear Ms. Lundy:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 343782.

The Galveston Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information related to a specified attorney fee bill. You state that the district is redacting some information pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), 20 U.S.C. § 1232(a).¹ You claim that portions of the submitted information are privileged under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence.² We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

First, we note, and you acknowledge, that the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. This section provides in part that

the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

¹We note that our office is prohibited from reviewing these education records to determine whether appropriate redactions under FERPA have been made; therefore, we will not address the applicability of FERPA to any of the submitted records.

²Although you claim the attorney-client privilege under section 552.101 of the Government Code, we note that section 552.101 does not encompass discovery privileges. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 1-3 (2002).

(16) information that is in a bill for attorney's fees and that is not privileged under the attorney-client privilege[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(16). In this instance, the submitted information consists of an attorney fee bill. Thus, the district must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(16) unless it is expressly confidential under other law. The Texas Supreme Court has held that the Texas Rules of Evidence and the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). We will therefore consider your arguments for the submitted attorney fee bill under Texas Rule of Evidence 503.

Rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence encompasses the attorney-client privilege and provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

(A) between the client or a representative of the client and the client's lawyer or a representative of the lawyer;

(B) between the lawyer and the lawyer's representative;

(C) by the client or a representative of the client, or the client's lawyer or a representative of the lawyer, to a lawyer or a representative of a lawyer representing another party in a pending action and concerning a matter of common interest therein;

(D) between representatives of the client or between the client and a representative of the client; or

(E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is "confidential" if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5). Thus, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must: (1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; (2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and (3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to

third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the information is privileged and confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the document does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *Pittsburgh Corning Corp. v. Caldwell*, 861 S.W.2d 423, 427 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1993, no writ).

You indicate that the submitted attorney fee bills contain confidential communications between the district's attorneys and the district that were made for the purposes of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the district. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we agree that most of the information you have marked reveals confidential communications between privileged parties. However, some of the remaining information you have marked does not consist of or reveal confidential attorney-client communications. Further, you do not explain the district's relationship with, or the capacities of, one of the parties involved in the remaining communications. Thus, you have failed to demonstrate how the remaining information you have marked documents privileged attorney-client communications and it may not be withheld under rule 503. Accordingly, the district may withhold the information you have marked, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, under Texas Rule of Evidence 503. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Tamara Wilcox
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TW/eeg

Ms. J. LeAnne Bram Lundy - Page 4

Ref: ID# 343782

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)