



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 13, 2009

Mr. Mark G. Mann  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Garland  
P.O. Box 469002  
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2009-09595

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 348738 (GCA9-0352).

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). The department received the present request on April 20, 2009. Accordingly, the department was required to request its decision from this office by May 4, 2009. However, the envelope in which the department's request for a ruling was submitted bears a postmark date of May 5, 2009. *See id.* § 552.308(a) (prescribing standards for timeliness of action by United States or interagency mail or common or contract carrier). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake, or when information is confidential by law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and generally is not a compelling reason to withhold information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). In failing to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its claim under section 552.108. However, because your claim under section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure, we will address this exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007, "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

- (1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

*Id.* § 58.007(c), (e), (j). We have reviewed the submitted information and find it involves allegations of delinquent juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information is subject to section 58.007. However, the submitted information indicates that the requestor is the attorney of one of the juvenile offenders listed in the report. Under section 58.007(e), the requestor may inspect or copy law enforcement records concerning his client. *Id.* § 58.007(e). We also note that section 58.007(j)(1) requires the redaction of any personally identifiable information concerning other juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). Thus, the department must withhold the information you have marked, in addition to the information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1). To the extent the submitted audio recording contains identifying information of juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses other than the requestor's client, this information must also be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1). The remaining information must be released to the requestor pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that because the requestor has a special right of access to this information in this instance, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Paige Savoie  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PS/eeg

Ref: ID# 348738

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)