



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 12, 2009

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2009-11241

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 352013.

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified incident involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrines of constitutional privacy and common-law privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we agree that portions of the submitted information are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not intimate or embarrassing or is of legitimate public interest. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Further, we find the department has failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

We note portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We have marked Texas driver's license information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note the requestor appears to be the spouse of the individual whose private information is at issue. As his wife's authorized representative, the requestor would have a right of access under section 552.023 to the information marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information marked under section 552.130, which protects personal privacy. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ("[a] person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). If the requestor is the individual's authorized representative, then he has a right of access to her private information, and that information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy or section 552.130. If the requestor is not the individual's authorized representative, then the department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 of the Government Code on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.130 of the Government Code. In either event, the remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

Sincerely,



Matt Entsminger
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRE/dls

Ref: ID# 352013

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²The remaining information contains a social security number subject to section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147(b) authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. Section 552.147 is based on privacy concerns. Accordingly, pursuant to section 552.023, the requestor has a right of access to his spouse's social security number if he is acting as her authorized representative. In addition, the information being released contains confidential information belonging to the requestor. Should the department receive another request for these same records from a person who would not have a right of access to the requestor's private information, the department should resubmit these records and request another decision. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302.