



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September-10, 2009

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2009-12771

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 355740 (Dallas ORR 2009-4949).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all files relating to two specific police officers, "including but not limited to personnel files and Internal Affairs investigation files[.]" You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that you have submitted only information pertaining to one internal investigation. Thus, to the extent any additional information relating to the officers, including personnel files, existed when the request was received, we assume it has been released. If such information has not been released, then it must be released at this time. *See*

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, you acknowledge the department failed to meet the deadlines prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting an open records ruling from this office. Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). You raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is discretionary and may be waived by failing to comply with section 552.301. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). You inform us that the Collin County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") asserts a law enforcement interest in the information at issue. Therefore, we will determine whether the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney. You also claim that the submitted information is confidential under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. Because these statutes can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure under section 552.302, we will consider your claims under these exceptions.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime... if ... release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note that the submitted information includes records pertaining to an internal administrative investigation. Section 552.108 is generally not applicable to internal administrative records that are not related to an investigation or prosecution of crime. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or

prosecution). You inform us that all the information at issue relates to a pending criminal prosecution by the district attorney. You state the district attorney has indicated that release of the information will harm its ability to prosecute the case. Based upon your representation and our review, we find that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have marked. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref'd n.r.e., 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (per curiam) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, the department may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. The department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, which states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of an accident report to a person who provides two of the following three items of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* The submitted information includes a Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report that was completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). In this

instance, the requestor has not provided the department with two of the three specified items of information. Therefore, the department must withhold the crash report pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Next, you claim that the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked in the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information that relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we agree that the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.136 of the Government Code for the employee numbers you have marked. Section 552.136 states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. We understand that a police officer's employee number is also used as the officer's city bank account number. Based upon this understanding, we agree the department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the Texas Peace Officer's Crash report under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²We note that the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Mack T. Harrison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MTH/eeg

Ref: ID# 355740

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)