



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 5, 2009

Mr. Bryan F. Russ, Jr.
Palmos, Russ, McCullough & Russ, L.L.P.
Attorney for City of Hearne Police Department
P.O. Box 909
Hearne, Texas 77859

OR2009-13957

Dear Mr. Russ:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 357510.

The Hearne Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for any information pertaining to a specified internal affairs investigation. You indicate you have released some of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Under section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). You inform us that the department received this request on July 23, 2009. However, you failed to claim section 552.103 of the Government Code

until August 12, 2009, and you failed to provide a copy of the written request for information until August 26, 2009. Consequently, we find that the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Thus, section 552.103 does not provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure, and the department may not withhold the submitted information under that exception. We note, however, that section 552.101 of the Government Code is applicable to portions of the submitted information.¹ Because the applicability of this section can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 of the Government Code to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have also found that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Further, information that is subject to the MPA also includes information that was obtained from medical records. *See* Occ. Code. § 159.002(a), (b), (c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

We have marked the records that are subject to the MPA. As the attorney representing the individual who is the subject of these records, the requestor may have a right of access to the medical records. These medical records must be released to the requestor on receipt of a signed, written consent from the requestor’s client, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). If this consent is not received, the medical records we have marked must be withheld from disclosure pursuant to the MPA and section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which governs the emergency medical service (“EMS”) records. Section 773.091 provides in part the following:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) Any person who receives information from confidential communications or records as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 773.092 who is acting on the survivor’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was obtained.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b)-(c), (g). Thus, except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), EMS records are deemed confidential under section 773.091 and, therefore, may only be released in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091-773.094. EMS records may be released to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf.” *Id.* § 773.092(e)(4). The consent must be in writing, signed by the patient, authorized representative, or personal representative, and specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) the reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Health & Safety Code § 773.093(a). In this instance, the requestor is an attorney for the person whose EMS records are at issue. Thus, except as specified by section 773.091(g), the department must withhold the marked EMS information under section 773.091, unless the requestor provides the department with written consent that meets the requirements of section 773.093(a). *Id.* §§ 773.092, .093; Open Records Decision No. 632 (1995).

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center confidential. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Gov’t Code § 411.083. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See id.* Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 -.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We have marked information the department must withhold pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the medical records we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA. Except as specified by section 773.091(g), the department must withhold the

²We note that an individual may obtain his own CHRI from the DPS. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(b)(3).

marked EMS information under section 773.091, unless the requestor provides the department with written consent that meets the requirements of section 773.093(a) of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Greg Henderson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GH/rl

Ref: ID# 357510

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)