



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

October 14, 2009

Mr. Robert E. Reyna
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2009-14500

Dear Mr. Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 358508 (SAPD ORR. 2008-3999).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You assert that the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a). However, section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. *See id.* § 261.201(h). We have been informed that the incident at issue occurred at a child care facility that was regulated under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. We therefore find that section 261.201 is not applicable to the investigation at issue, and we determine that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 on that basis.

You also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007 makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* §§ 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of section 58.007 as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct), 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision,” respectively, for purposes of the Family Code). Section 58.007(c) does not apply to law enforcement records that relate to a juvenile only as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party; rather the juvenile must be involved as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Upon review, we find the submitted information

involves a juvenile engaging in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to this report. Therefore, we conclude that the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, we note the submitted information contains medical records that pertain to one of the requestor's clients which are governed under the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We note medical records involving a minor may be released under the MPA on the parent's or legal guardian's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) the reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, 159.005.

Although the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code, the MPA may provide the requestor with a right of access to the portion of the information consisting of his client's medical records. Therefore, there is a conflict between the provisions of section 58.007 of the Family Code and the MPA. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence that the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 58.007 generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, the MPA specifically permits release of medical records to certain parties and in certain circumstances. Accordingly, the MPA prevails over section 58.007. Thus, the department must release or withhold the marked medical records in accordance with the MPA.

In summary, the department must release or withhold the marked medical records in accordance with the MPA. The remaining information must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/eeg

Ref: ID# 358508

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
Dana A. Ortiz
16500 San Pedro, Suite 302
San Antonio, TX 78232
(w/o enclosures)

¹Although you claim section 552.108 for the marked medical records, the MPA prevails over the general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 at 4 (1986). Accordingly, the department may not withhold the medical records under section 552.108.