



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 4, 2009

Ms. Candice M. De La Garza
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2009-15697

Dear Mr. De La Garza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 360782.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information related to a specified accident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 through 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. You did not, however, submit to this office written comments stating the reasons why each exception you raised would allow the information to be withheld. Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to submit to this office the information required in section 552.301(e) results in the legal

presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. See *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. See Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You assert the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 through 552.147. In failing to comply with the requirements of section 552.301, you have waived the discretionary exceptions you raised. See Open Records Decision Nos. 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Accordingly, the requested information may not be withheld under any of the claimed discretionary exceptions. We note, however, section 552.130 of the Government Code is applicable to some of the submitted information. Because this section can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address whether the submitted information must be withheld under this section.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note that the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, Texas motor vehicle record information that pertains to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. See *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enterprises, Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.) (Texas does not recognize relational or derivative right of privacy); see also Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). You have highlighted Texas driver's license, license plate, and vehicle identification numbers, as well as vehicle registration year information, in the submitted police report. One of the Texas driver's license numbers you highlighted pertains to a deceased individual. Therefore, the department may not withhold this number, which we have marked for release, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the remaining motor vehicle record information you have highlighted, as well as the additional Texas driver's license number, license plate numbers, vehicle identification number, and vehicle registration month information we have marked in the accident report and the submitted pictures, under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released.¹

¹We note the submitted accident report contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jessica Eales
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JCE/eeg

Ref: ID# 360782

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)