



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 5, 2009

Lt. Michael Penshorn  
Commander, Supports Services Division  
New Braunfels Police Department  
1488 South Seguin Avenue  
New Braunfels, Texas 78130

OR2009-15762

Dear Lt. Penshorn:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 360834.

The New Braunfels Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the department or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201 (a), (k), (l). You state the submitted report was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining "abuse" for the purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Based on your representations and our review, we find the submitted report is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, the requestor is the parent of the child victim listed in the report, and the parent is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. In this instance, the department may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold this report from this requestor. *Id.* § 261.201(k). Section 261.201(l)(2), however, states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.*

§ 261.201(1)(2). Further, section 261.201(1)(3) states the identity of the reporting party must be withheld. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(3). You assert the submitted report is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy. Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrines of constitutional privacy and common-law privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

Common-law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information at issue is either not highly intimate or embarrassing or it is of legitimate public interest. Further, we find the department has failed to demonstrate how any portion of the submitted information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Thus, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. Therefore, with the exception of the identity of the reporting party which must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3), the department must release the submitted information.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the information being released contains confidential information regarding the alleged child victim to which the requestor has a right of access as the child's parent. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). If the department receives another request for this particular information from a different requestor, then the department should again seek a decision from this office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PL/eeg

Ref: ID# 360834

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)