



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 2, 2009

Mr. Kerry D. Sullivan
General Counsel
State Office of Administrative Hearings
P.O. Box 13025
Austin, Texas 78711-3025

OR2009-17023

Dear Mr. Sullivan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 362889.

The State Office of Administrative Hearings (the "SOAH") received a request for information to or from any administrative law judge pertaining to (1) subpoenas for breath test supervisor and/or breath test operator and (2) the Executive Office of the Arizona Motor Vehicle Department. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.107, 552.111, and 552.144 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim.

We must address the SOAH's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, the governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)*. As of the date of this letter, you have not submitted to this office a copy or representative sample of the requested information for our review or provided any comments stating why the information should be withheld. Thus, we find that the SOAH failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to submit to this office the information required in section 552.301(e) results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302 of the Government Code); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by showing the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* ORD 630. By failing to comply with the procedural requirements of the Act, the SOAH waived its discretionary claims against disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 11-12 (2002) (attorney-client privilege under section 552.107 and Texas Rule of Evidence 503 subject to waiver), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for a decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 630 at 4-5 (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.107), 470 at 7 (1987) (statutory predecessor to section 552.111 subject to waiver). We therefore conclude the SOAH must release the information at issue to the requestor. If you believe the information is confidential and may not lawfully be released, you must challenge this ruling in court pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/eeg

Ref: ID# 362889

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)