



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 2, 2009

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2009-17131

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 368143.

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for incident report number 09-212145. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). In this instance, you state the department received the request for information on October 27, 2009. However, you did not request a ruling from this office until November 12, 2009. Thus, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information presumed public must be released unless a governmental

body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *Id.*; *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); see Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. See Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You assert the submitted incident report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. This section, however, is discretionary in nature. It serves only to protect a governmental body's interests, and may be waived; as such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. See Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, the submitted incident report may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address whether the submitted information must be withheld from public disclosure under this exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007. Under section 58.007, juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007, a “child” is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted report involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to this report. Therefore, the submitted report is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Amy L.S. Shipp
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ALS/cc

Ref: ID# 368143

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Ref: ID# 368143

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)