



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

February 12, 2010

Mr. Joe Torres, III  
216 N. Texas Boulevard, Suite 2  
Alice, Texas 78332

OR2010-02203

Dear Mr. Torres:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 370218.

The City of Alice (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all reports pertaining to a named individual filed from April 2008 through November 2009. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find

that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, seeks all of the city's records involving a named individual during a specified time frame. This request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history. Thus, this portion of the request implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. You submitted sixteen reports which do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Accordingly, we will address your remaining argument against disclosure of these reports.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication;

(3) it is information relating to a threat against a peace officer or detention officer collected or disseminated under Section 411.048; or

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

- (1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution;
- (2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; or
- (3) the internal record or notation:
  - (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or
  - (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)-(b). Although you generally assert the submitted information is excepted under section 552.108, you have not specified the subsection of section 552.108 that applies to the information, nor have you submitted any specific arguments explaining how that subsection applies to the information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (stating it is governmental body's burden to establish applicability of claimed exception or otherwise explain why requested information should not be released). Consequently, you have failed to establish the applicability of section 552.108 of the Government Code to the submitted information, and the city may not withhold any information on that basis.

The submitted information contains Texas driver's license numbers subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The city must withhold the driver's license numbers we marked in the submitted reports under section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

In summary, to the extent the city maintains or has access to law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>2</sup>We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

with common-law privacy. The city must also withhold the Texas driver's license numbers we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Bob Davis  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RSD/cc

Ref: ID# 370218

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the information being released includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.