



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

May 17, 2010

Mr. Robert Reyna
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283

OR2010-07039

Dear Mr. Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 379509 (COSA File No. 2010-5159).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for twenty-nine categories of information related to accident number 8410884. You claim the submitted information pertaining to report number 10-0062380 is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. The department acknowledges, and we agree, that it failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301. A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements the Act results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 279 S.W.3d 806, 811 (Tex. App.—2007, pet. granted); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994).

Normally, a compelling interest is demonstrated when some other source of law makes the information at issue confidential or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the need of another governmental body to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). You provide a letter from the Bexar County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") objecting to the release of the submitted information. Accordingly, we will consider the district attorney's arguments under section 552.108.

First, however, we note the submitted information contains a Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report ("accident report") which was completed pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 550.065(b), which states, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged for the confidential use of certain specified entities. Transp. Code § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of an accident report to a person who provides at least two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with two of the three pieces of information specified by section 550.065(c)(4). Although the district attorney contends the submitted accident report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, as a general rule, statutes governing the release of specific information prevail over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. Attorney General Opinion DM-146 at 3 (1992); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Thus, the department must release the accident report in its entirety to the requestor.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). In her letter, the district attorney states the release of the remaining information would interfere

with the pending investigation and prosecution of this case by her office. Based on this representation and our review, we find the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases); see also Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987) (section 552.108 may be invoked by any proper custodian of information relating to pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct).

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, the department must release the accident report we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jessica Eales
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JCE/eeg

Ref: ID# 379509

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)