



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

May 17, 2010

Ms. Neera Chatterjee  
Office of General Counsel  
The University of Texas System  
201 West Seventh Street  
Austin, Texas 78701-2902

OR2010-07041

Dear Ms. Chatterjee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 379533.

The University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston (the "university") received a request for an electronic version of the Texas School Ready! Project certification analysis. You state you will release some of the requested information. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 51.914 of the Education Code provides in relevant part:

In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information shall be confidential and shall not be subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee[.]

Educ. Code § 51.914(1). The legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular information has “a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997). Furthermore, whether particular information has such a potential is a question of fact that this office is unable to resolve in the opinion process. *See id.* Thus, this office has stated that in considering whether requested information has “a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee,” we will rely on a university’s assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.*; *but see id.* at 10 (university’s determination that information has potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for fee is subject to judicial review). We note that section 51.194(1) is not applicable to working titles of experiments or other information that does not reveal the details of the research. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 557 at 3 (1990), 497 at 6-7 (1988). Moreover, section 51.914(1) is applicable only to information “developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education.” Educ. Code § 51.914(1).

You inform us that the submitted information includes the detailed certification analysis used by the university’s Children Learning’s Institute and Texas State Center for Early Childhood Development to determine whether a given early childhood education program will receive certification under the Texas School Ready! program. You claim this information is a product, device, or process developed by university researchers. You state the information has the potential to be sold, traded, or licensed for a fee to similar certification programs outside of Texas. Based on your representations and our review, we agree that the submitted information is confidential under section 51.914 of the Education Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information

under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Andrea L. Caldwell  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ALC/eeg

Ref: ID# 379533

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)