



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

September 28, 2010

Ms. Candice M. De La Garza  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Houston  
P.O. Box 368  
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2010-14753

Dear Ms. De La Garza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 394889 (City of Houston PIR #17439).

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for (1) all documents related to an accident that occurred on a specified date involving a named city employee and a specified vehicle; (2) photographs taken in connection with the accident; (3) two named employees' personnel files; and (4) information regarding all accidents in the solid waste department during a specified time period. You state the city will provide the requested personnel files and information pertaining to accidents in the solid waste department to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note Exhibit 3 includes a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another

governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the city with two of the specified pieces of information. Although you seek to withhold the CR-3 accident report under section 552.103 of the Government Code, we note information that is specifically made public by statute may not be withheld from the public under any of the general exceptions to public disclosure under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 544 (1990), 378 (1983), 161 (1977), 146 (1976). Accordingly, the city must release the CR-3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

Next, we note the remaining information constitutes a completed investigation subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(1) provides for required public disclosure of “a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body[,]” unless the information is expressly confidential under other law or excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(1). Although you seek to withhold Exhibits 2 and 3 under section 552.103 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body’s interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 439, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas, 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). As such, section 552.103 is not other law that makes information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the city may not withhold Exhibits 2 and 3 under section 552.103. However, we note Exhibit 3 contains information subject to sections 552.117 and 552.130 of the Government Code, which are “other law” for purposes of section 552.022.<sup>1</sup> Therefore, we will address these exceptions. Additionally, we will address your argument under section 552.101 of the Government Code for Exhibit 5.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in relevant part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

*Id.* § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we agree Exhibit 5 constitutes a medical record that is subject to the MPA. Accordingly, the city may only release Exhibit 5 in accordance with the MPA.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Whether information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The city may only withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) if the individual at issue elected confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for information was made. We have marked the home address of a city employee. If the employee at issue timely elected to withhold this personal information, the city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1). If the employee did not make a timely election, the city may not withhold the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]" Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). We have marked a Texas driver's license number and motor vehicle record information. The city must withhold this marked information under section 552.130.<sup>2</sup>

In summary, the city may only release Exhibit 5 in accordance with the MPA. In Exhibit 3, the city must withhold (1) the home address we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, if the employee at issue made a timely election to keep this information confidential, and (2) the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

---

<sup>2</sup>We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license and license plate numbers and portions of photographs that reveal license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ACV/eeg

Ref: ID# 394889

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)