



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 10, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-00499

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 405629 (DPD #2010-9657).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records relating to arrests on two specified dates at a named club and all records relating to complaints made against the named club during a specified period of time. You claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, portions of the requested information may have been the subject of a previous request for information, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2010-16896 (2010). In that decision, we determined the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government except for basic

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

information. We have no indication the law, facts, and circumstances on which the prior ruling was based have changed. Accordingly, with regard to the requested information that is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office in the prior ruling, we conclude the department may continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2010-16896 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). However, to the extent the requested information is not encompassed by the previous ruling, we will address your claimed exceptions under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

We understand the City of Dallas is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.318. You have marked the telephone number and address of a 9-1-1 caller the department seeks to withhold. We conclude that, if the marked telephone number and address were furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, then the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. If the marked information was not provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, then it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.318.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *See id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information

relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we agree the information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the information you marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you marked, as well as the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, with regard to the requested information that is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office in the prior ruling, we conclude the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2010-16896 as a previous

²We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license and license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. To the extent the marked telephone number and address were furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, then the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the marked information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/eeg

Ref: ID# 405629

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note you marked a social security number in the remaining information. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.