



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 28, 2011

Mr. William P. Chesser
City Attorney
City of Brownwood
P.O. Box 1389
Brownwood, Texas 76804

OR2011-01481

Dear Mr. Chesser:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 407506.

The City of Brownwood (the "city") received a request for all police records involving a named individual. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v.*

Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note, however, that records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history record information. Cf. Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

The present request seeks information pertaining to a named individual. We find that this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, that you have submitted information in which the named individual is not listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. You have also submitted information that relates to a routine traffic violation. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and thus does not implicate the individual's right to privacy. Accordingly, this information may not be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in part as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find case number 05-003445 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse under chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining "abuse" for purposes of Family Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes).

As there is no indication that the city's police department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we find case number 05-003445 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the constitutional right to privacy. Constitutional privacy protects two kinds of interests. See *Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the "zones of privacy," pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. See *Fadjo v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); Open Records Decision No. 455 at 3-7 (1987). The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. See *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual's privacy interest against the public's interest in the information. See ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492). Upon review, we find that the city has failed to demonstrate that any of the remaining information constitutes the most intimate aspects of human affairs, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 based on constitutional privacy.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold case number 05-003445 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The remaining information must be released.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Casterline', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/vb

Ref: ID# 407506

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)