



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 15, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-03559

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 412321 (DPD PIR #2011-00040).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request from a United States Probation Officer for information pertaining to a specified offense involving a named individual that occurred on a specified date. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

We note the information at issue is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code.² Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

¹This letter ruling assumes that the submitted representative sample of information is truly representative of the requested information as a whole. This ruling does not reach, and therefore does not authorize, the withholding of any other requested information to the extent that the other information is substantially different than that submitted to this office. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D), .302; Open Records Decision Nos. 499 at 6 (1988), 497 at 4 (1988).

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Because the requested information pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of section 22.011 as “a person younger than 17 years of age”). Thus, we find the submitted report is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, section 261.201(a) also provides that information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

We note that chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] about a person.” Gov’t Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) A person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). "Criminal history record information" is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information contains "criminal history record information." However, a criminal justice agency that receives criminal history record information from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, if the requestor in this instance represents a "criminal justice agency," she is authorized to obtain criminal history record information from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

A "criminal justice agency" is defined in part as "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]" Gov't Code § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines "administration of criminal justice" as the "performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of criminal history record information." Code Crim. Proc. art. 60.01(1).

The requestor, in this instance, is a United States Probation Officer. Although it appears that the requestor is engaged in the administration of criminal justice, we cannot determine whether she intends to use the submitted criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the department determines that the requestor intends to use the submitted criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code, we conclude that the department must make available to the requestor information from the submitted information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, the department must withhold the remainder of the information from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. We note that, if the department determines that the requestor intends to use the submitted criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the requestor has statutory right of access to the information and the department may not withhold the information from the requestor

pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.³ *See Gallagher Headquarters Ranch Dev., Ltd. v. City of San Antonio*, 269 S.W.3d 628, 637 (Tex. App.— San Antonio 2008, pet. filed) (when statute directly conflicts with common law principle or claim, statutory provision controls and preempts common law; legislature may enact legislation that preempts or supersedes common law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Road*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law).

If, however, the department determines that the requestor does not seek this information for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code, the department must withhold the submitted information from disclosure in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Attorney General Opinions DM-353 at 4 n.6 (1995) (finding interagency transfer of information prohibited where confidentiality statute enumerates specific entities to which release of information is authorized and where potential receiving governmental body is not among statute's enumerated entities), JM-590 at 4-5 (1986); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (i)-(l) (listing circumstances under which 261.201 information may be released); Open Records Decision Nos. 655 (1997), 650 (1996) (transfer of confidential information to federal agency impermissible unless federal law requires its disclosure), 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

In summary, if the department determines that the requestor intends to use the submitted criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code, the department must release the criminal history record information to the requestor and withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. Otherwise, the department must withhold the information in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

³Common-law privacy protects information if: (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976).

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Lindsay E. Hale".

Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/em

Ref: ID# 412321

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)