



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

March 31, 2011

Ms. Julie Fetherton  
City Secretary  
City of Garrett  
208 North Ferris Street  
Garret, Texas 75119

OR2011-04448

Dear Ms. Fetherton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 413240.

The City of Garret (the "city") received a request for information related to a specified traffic citation. You indicate the city has released a copy of the citation to the requestor. You state the city does not have information responsive to the portion of the request seeking photographs.<sup>1</sup> We understand you to claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this

---

<sup>1</sup>The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *Id.* § 552.301(b). The city received the request for information on December 8, 2010; however, the city did not request ruling from this office until January 25, 2011. Further the city did not provide a copy of the written request until February 1, 2011, and the responsive documents until March 21, 2011. Thus, the city failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). The city's claim under section 552.108 is not a compelling reason for nondisclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). However, the need of another governmental body to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason under section 552.302. *See* ORD 586 at 3. In this instance, the city asserts the law enforcement interests of the city prosecutor (the "prosecutor") under section 552.108. As the prosecutor's interests under this exception can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure, we will consider your arguments on behalf of the prosecutor. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted video relates to a case that is pending prosecution with the prosecutor's office and that the prosecutor would like the information withheld. Based on these representations and our review, we agree release of the submitted video would interfere with the detection, investigation, or

prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559. Accordingly, the city may withhold the submitted video under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara Wilcox  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

TW/tf

Ref: ID# 413240

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)