



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 13, 2011

Mr. W. Lee Auvenshine
Assistant Ellis County & District Attorney
Ellis County Courts Building
109 South Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2011-05129

Dear Mr. Auvenshine:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 414328.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for a copy of a specified report. You claim the submitted report is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential such as section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2)-(3). You represent the submitted report was used or developed in the sheriff's investigation of indecency with a five-year-old child. *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of "abuse" for purposes of Family Code chapter 261 includes offense of indecency with a child under Penal Code section 21.11); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Based on your representations and our review, we find the report is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. In this instance, however, the report reveals the requestor is the parent of the alleged child victim listed in the report. Further, the parent is not the individual alleged to have committed the alleged abuse. *See id.* § 261.201(k).

Accordingly, the sheriff may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold the submitted information from the requestor. *Id.* Section 261.201(1)(2) states, however, that any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Thus, because you also assert sections 552.101 in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code for the report, we will address your remaining arguments under the Act.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrines of common-law and constitutional privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). In this instance, the report pertains to a sex-related offense. Generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). However, a governmental body must generally withhold all of the information pertaining to a sexual assault when the requestor knows the identity of the alleged sexual assault victim. *See* ORD 393.

Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

In this instance, the requestor is the parent of the alleged child victim. Therefore, she is the child victim's authorized representative. Under section 552.023 of the Government Code, "a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself or person for whom she is authorized representative). Therefore, the sheriff may not withhold the report from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with either common-law or constitutional privacy.

You also claim the report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the report relates to a case that is closed and did not result in a prosecution. Based on your representations and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the report.¹

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Basic information includes the identity of the complainant. *Id.* at 4. However, the complainant in the report is also the reporting party. Section 261.201(1)(3) states the identity of the reporting party must be withheld. Fam. Code § 261.201(1)(3). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the report may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, in releasing basic information, the sheriff must withhold the reporting party’s identity, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the report may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, in releasing basic information, the sheriff must withhold the identity of the reporting party we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php.

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenneth Leland Conyer
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLC/eeg

Ref: ID# 414328

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)