



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 12, 2011

Mr. William M. Buechler
Buechler & Associates
3660 Stoneridge Road, Suite D-101
Austin, Texas 78746

OR2011-06637

Dear Mr. Buechler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 417431.

The Flour Bluff Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for all e-mails to and from two named individuals since October 31 pertaining to certain information. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you acknowledge the district failed to notify the requestor of the request for a ruling within the statutory time period prescribed by section 552.301(d) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(d). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential by law. Open Records

Decision No. 150 (1977). Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of this section to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Whether information is subject to a legitimate public interest and therefore not protected by common-law privacy must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 373 (1983). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate that any portion of the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, we determine the district may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the submitted information contains an e-mail address of a member of the public. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c).¹ Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address we have marked is not one of the types specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release under section 552.137(b).² As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the remaining information must be released.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/em

Ref: ID# 417431

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)