



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 24, 2011

Ms. Jessica Sangsvang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2011-07317

Dear Ms. Sangsvang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 418613 (Fort Worth PIR No. W007353).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for 9-1-1 call records pertaining to a specified address over a specified time period. You state that you have redacted certain Texas motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code pursuant to the previous determinations issued to the city in Open Records Letter Nos. 2006-14726 (2006) and 2007-00198 (2007). *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001). You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We will first address your claim under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, as it is potentially the most encompassing. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide affidavits from the city's police department stating, that the reports you

have marked relate to pending criminal investigations. Based upon this representation, we conclude that release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is generally applicable to the reports you have marked.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). The city must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if this information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the reports you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. See Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” See *id.* § 411.082(2). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. See generally *id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to a person's current involvement

¹As our ruling for this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments for this information.

with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). In addition, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information, which we have marked, consist of CHRI that is confidential under chapter 411. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law. However, none of the remaining information you have marked consists of CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). You state the city is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. You state the telephone numbers and address you have marked were provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier. Based on your representations, we conclude the city must withhold the telephone numbers and address you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses article 62.051 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Article 62.051 of the Code of Criminal Procedure requires a sex offender registrant to provide the following information for DPS sex offender registration database: the person's full name; each alias; date of birth; sex; race; height; weight; eye color; hair color; social security number; driver's license number; shoe size; home address; a recent color photograph, or if possible, an electronic image of the person; a complete set of fingerprints; the type of offense the person was convicted of; the age of the victim; the date of conviction; the punishment received; an indication as to whether the person is discharged, paroled, or released on juvenile probation, community supervision, or mandatory supervision; an indication of each license, as defined by article 62.005(g), that is held or sought by the person; an indication as to whether the person is or will be employed, carrying on a vocation, or a student at a particular public or private institution of higher education in this state or another state, and the name and address of that institution; and any other information required by DPS. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 62.051(c). This information is public information with the exception of the person's social security number, driver's license number, telephone number, all information required by DPS outside of the enumerated categories of information, and any information that would identify the victim of the offense for which the person is subject to registration. *See id.* art. 62.005(b). Thus, the city must

withhold or release the sex offender registration information we have marked that is subject to article 62.005 of the Code of Criminal Procedure in accordance with article 62.005(b).

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note incident report number 110102916 consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, video tapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect under chapter 261. Accordingly, we find report number 110102916 is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). You have not indicated that the city’s police department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, report number 110102916 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that a compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t*

of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

Upon review, we find that the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Therefore, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the reports you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. The city must withhold the telephone numbers and address you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. The city must withhold or release the sex offender registration information we have marked that is subject to article 62.005 of the Code of Criminal Procedure in accordance with article 62.005(b). The city must withhold report number 110102916 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 261.201 of the Family Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Jennifer Luttrall".

Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/dls

Ref: ID# 418613

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)