



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 29, 2011

Mr. Braden W. Metcalf
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Harger & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Lincoln Plaza
500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2011-17586

Dear Mr. Metcalf:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 437628 (Farmers Branch Reference No. 51435).

The Farmers Branch Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all information related to the investigation of or filing of charges involving a named individual over a specified period, including activities related to city elections and election candidates. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a

compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not private and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted several reports that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, this information is not part of a criminal history compilation. Therefore, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct"). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find incident report number 178544 involves a child allegedly engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to this information. Thus, the report, which we have marked, is confidential in its entirety pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (2). As a general rule, the protections afforded by subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(a)(2) are mutually exclusive. Section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to information pertaining to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution, while section 552.108(a)(2) protects law enforcement records pertaining to a criminal investigation or prosecution that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why claimed exceptions to disclosure apply); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information relates to open and active cases and that release of this information would interfere with the criminal detection and investigation of the alleged crimes. Accordingly, we understand you to raise section 552.108(a)(1) for these reports. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that release of this information, which we have marked, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we find section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code applicable to the information we have marked.

However, we note, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information the department may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy for a portion of the basic information. Common-law privacy also protects the types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*, including information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has determined that other types of information also are private under section 552.101. *See generally* Open

Records Decision No. 659 at 4-5 (1999) (summarizing information attorney general has held to be private). Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. Upon review, we find none of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold in its entirety the report we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/sdk

Ref: ID# 437628

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)