



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 31, 2012

Mr. Marc Allen Connelly  
Deputy General Counsel  
Texas Department of State Health Services  
P.O. Box 149347  
Austin, Texas 78714-9347

OR2012-01589

Dear Mr. Connelly:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 444153 (DSHS File # 19579).

The Texas Department of State Health Services (the "department") received a request for the requestor's Outlook files on the requestor's computer and on the main server. You state the department has released or will release some of the requested information. You also state the department will withhold some of the requested information pursuant to the previous determination issued to the department by this office in Open Records Letter No. 2010-18849 (2010).<sup>1</sup> See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001). You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, 552.111, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2010-18849 serves as a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold information furnished to or created or gathered by the department that is related to cases or suspected cases of diseases or health conditions under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 81.046 of the Health and Safety Code, unless the release provisions of section 81.046 are applicable or the requestor has a right of access under any other provision of law.

information.<sup>2</sup> We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it was created after the department received the request for information. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the department is not required to release such information in response to this request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (the "ADA"). *See* 42 U.S.C. § 12101 *et seq.* Title I of the ADA provides that information about the medical conditions and medical histories of applicants or employees must be (1) collected and maintained on separate forms, (2) kept in separate medical files, and (3) treated as a confidential medical record. Information obtained in the course of a "fitness for duty examination" conducted to determine whether an employee is still able to perform the essential functions of his or her job is to be treated as a confidential medical record as well. *See* 29 C.F.R. § 1630.14(c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 641 (1996). Furthermore, the federal Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (the "EEOC") has determined that medical information for the purposes of the ADA includes "specific information about an individual's disability and related functional limitations, as well as general statements that an individual has a disability or that an ADA reasonable accommodation has been provided for a particular individual." *See* Letter from Ellen J. Vargyas, Legal Counsel, EEOC, to Barry Kearney, Associate General Counsel, National Labor Relations Board, 3 (Oct. 1, 1997). Federal regulations define "disability" for the purposes of the ADA as "(1) a physical or mental impairment that substantially limits one or more of the major life activities of the individual; (2) a record of such an impairment; or (3) being regarded as having such an impairment." 29 C.F.R. § 1630.2(g). The regulations further provide that physical or mental impairment means: (1) any physiological disorder, or condition, cosmetic disfigurement, or anatomical loss affecting one or more of the following body systems: neurological, musculoskeletal, special sense organs, respiratory (including speech organs), cardiovascular, reproductive, digestive, genito-urinary, hemic and lymphatic, skin, and endocrine; or (2) any mental or psychological disorder, such as mental retardation, organic brain syndrome, emotional or mental illness, and specific learning disabilities. *See id.* § 1630.2(h). Upon review of the information at issue, we agree the information you have

---

<sup>2</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

marked is confidential under the ADA. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Family Medical Leave Act (the“FMLA”), section 2654 of title 29 of the United States Code. Section 825.500 of chapter V of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations identifies the record-keeping requirements for employers that are subject to the FMLA. Subsection (g) of section 825.500 states:

Records and documents relating to certifications, recertifications or medical histories of employees or employees’ family members, created for purposes of FMLA, shall be maintained as confidential medical records in separate files/records from the usual personnel files, and if the ADA, as amended, is also applicable, such records shall be maintained in conformance with ADA confidentiality requirements[], except that:

- (1) Supervisors and managers may be informed regarding necessary restrictions on the work or duties of an employee and necessary accommodations;
- (2) First aid and safety personnel may be informed (when appropriate) if the employee’s physical or medical condition might require emergency treatment; and
- (3) Government officials investigating compliance with FMLA (or other pertinent law) shall be provided relevant information upon request.

29 C.F.R. § 825.500(g). We note a portion of the remaining information, which we have marked, is confidential under section 825.500 of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations. Further, we find none of the release provisions of the FMLA apply to this information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the FMLA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 88.002 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in pertinent part:

- (a) Except as specifically authorized by this chapter, reports, records, and information furnished to a health authority, a regional director, or the department that relate to cases or suspected cases of children with blood lead levels of concern or lead poisoning are confidential and may be used only for the purposes of this chapter.

(b) Reports, records, and information relating to cases or suspected cases of childhood lead poisoning and children with blood lead levels of concern are not public information under the open records law, Chapter 552, Government Code, and may not be released or made public on subpoena or otherwise except as provided by this chapter.

(c) Medical, epidemiologic, or toxicologic information may be released:

(1) for statistical purposes if released in a manner that prevents the identification of any person;

(2) with the consent of each person identified in the information;

(3) to medical personnel, appropriate state agencies, health authorities, regional directors, and public officers of counties and municipalities as necessary to comply with this chapter and related rules;

(4) to appropriate federal agencies, such as the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention of the United States Public Health Service, except that the information must be limited to the information requested by the agency; or

(5) to medical personnel to the extent necessary in a medical emergency to protect the health or life of the child identified in the information.

Health and Safety Code § 88.002(a)-(c). You state the information submitted as Exhibit E relates to children with blood lead levels of concern or lead poisoning. You do not indicate any of the release provisions in section 88.002(c) apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of section 88.002 to most of the information submitted as Exhibit E. However, we find you have not demonstrated how a portion of Exhibit E, which we have marked for release, consists of a report, record, or information relating to cases or suspected cases of childhood lead poisoning and children with blood lead levels of concern for purposes of section 88.002. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information submitted as Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 88.002 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the

public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (information pertaining to prescription drugs, specific illnesses, operations and procedures, and physical disabilities protected from disclosure). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, no portion of the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing, and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5; *see Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985). After review of the remaining information at issue, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information that comes within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services" to the client

governmental body. *See* TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *See In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, lawyer representatives, and a lawyer representing another party in a pending action and concerning a matter of common interest therein. *See* TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, *id.*, meaning it was “not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the intent of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *See Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, no pet.). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state the information you marked within Exhibit B consists of communications involving attorneys for the department, legal staff, and department employees in their capacities as clients. You state these communications were made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the department. You state these communications were confidential, and you state the department has not waived the confidentiality of the information at issue. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to most of the information you marked within Exhibit B. However, we note some of the information at issue consists of communications with individuals whom you have not demonstrated are privileged parties. This information, which we have marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department may withhold the information you marked within Exhibit B under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. We further note several of the individual e-mails contained in the otherwise privileged e-mail strings are communications with individuals whom you have not shown to be privileged parties. Thus, to the extent these non-privileged e-mails, which we have marked, exist separate and apart

from the otherwise privileged e-mail strings, they may not be withheld under section 552.107(1).

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an interagency or intra-agency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency.” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ). We determined section 552.111 excepts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995).

Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events that are severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, the factual information also may be withheld under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

This office has also concluded a preliminary draft of a document that is intended for public release in its final form necessarily represents the drafter’s advice, opinion, and recommendation with regard to the form and content of the final document, so as to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 559 at 2 (1990) (applying statutory predecessor). Section 552.111 protects factual information in the draft that also will be included in the final version of the document. *See id.* at 2-3. Thus, section 552.111 encompasses the entire contents, including comments, underlining, deletions, and proofreading marks, of a preliminary draft of a policymaking document that will be released to the public in its final form. *See id.* at 2.

You state the information at issue consists of the department's Division for Regulatory Services Environmental and Consumer Safety Section working records relating to rule making process, policy procedures, and internal discussions of developing policies and work strategy initiatives. Thus, you indicate the information at issue consists of advice, recommendations, and opinions of department personnel pertaining to the policymaking functions of the department. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find the department has demonstrated portions of the information at issue, which we have marked, consist of advice, opinions, or recommendations on the policymaking matters of the department. Thus, the department may withhold the marked information under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, you do not state whether the submitted draft documents, which we have marked, will be released to the public in their final form. Thus, to the extent the marked draft documents will be released to the public in their final form, the department may withhold the marked draft documents in their entireties under section 552.111 of the Government Code. If the submitted draft documents will not be released to the public in their final form, then the department may not withhold them under section 552.111 of the Government Code. Furthermore, we find the remaining information at issue is general administrative and purely factual information or does not pertain to policymaking. Thus, we find you have failed to show how the remaining information at issue consists of advice, opinions, or recommendations on the policymaking matters of the department. Accordingly, the remaining information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1)*. We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988)* (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). We further note section 552.117(a)(1) is not applicable to a former spouse and does not protect the fact that a governmental employee has been divorced. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Therefore, to the extent the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1); however, the marked cellular telephone numbers may be withheld only if a governmental

body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. Conversely, if the individuals at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, or a governmental body pays for the marked cellular telephone numbers, the department may not withhold the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1).<sup>3</sup> However, we find the remaining information you marked does not consist of the home address, telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, or family member information of a current or former employee of the department, and the remaining information you marked may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information you marked does not consist of motor vehicle record information and it may not be withheld under section 552.130.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the requestor has a right to her own e-mail address under section 552.137(b). *Id.* § 552.137(b). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the department must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners have affirmatively consented to their public disclosure.

In summary, the department must withhold (1) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the ADA; (2) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the FMLA; (3) with the exception of the information we marked for release, the information submitted as Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 88.002 of the Health and Safety Code; (4) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (5) the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, to the extent the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, but may withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service; (6) the

---

<sup>3</sup>Regardless of the applicability of section 552.117 of the Government Code, we note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See Gov't Code* § 552.147(b).

motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (7) the personal e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners have affirmatively consented to their public disclosure. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department may withhold the information you marked within Exhibit B under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code; however, to the extent the marked non-privileged e-mails exist separate and apart from the submitted e-mail strings, they may not be withheld under section 552.107(1). The department may withhold the information we marked within Exhibit C under section 552.111 of the Government Code; however, the marked draft documents may be withheld under section 552.111 only if they will be released to the public in their final form. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/agn

Ref: ID# 444153

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)