



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 28, 2012

Ms. Liz Goins
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2012-04550

Dear Ms. Goins:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 449020 (PIR# 12-0234).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for twenty-eight categories of information pertaining to a specified toxicology report from a specified crime lab. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments submitted by the Smith County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office"). *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that any person may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, the governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the

date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). You state the department received the request on December 13, 2011. However, you did not submit to our office the information required by sections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e) until January 23, 2012. Thus, we find the department failed to comply with its deadlines under section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception that may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). The district attorney's office asserts an interest under section 552.108 of the Government Code in the information at issue. Therefore, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney's office.

We note the submitted documents contain information pertaining to the analysis of a blood specimen obtained by a peace officer. Section 724.018 of the Transportation Code provides that “[o]n the request of a person who has given a specimen at the request of a peace officer, *full information* concerning the analysis of the specimen shall be made available to the person or the person's attorney.” Transp. Code § 724.018 (emphasis added). We find that “full information” under section 724.018 refers to the results of the analysis of the specimen, and includes the “Alcohol Analysis Laboratory Report,” the “Alcohol Analysis Worksheet,” the “Toxicology/Blood Alcohol Kit Laboratory Submission Form,” and the submitted charts and graphs. In this instance, the requestor is the authorized representative of the person who gave the blood specimen at the request of a peace officer. Although you seek to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific statutory right of access provision prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 at 4 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under statutory predecessor to Act). Therefore, the department must release the submitted results of the analysis of the blood specimen at

issue, which we have marked, to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The district attorney’s office states the remaining information relates to a pending criminal prosecution and that release of the information would interfere with its criminal prosecution of this case. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the submitted results of the analysis of the blood specimen at issue, which we have marked, to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code. The department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/eb

Ref: ID# 449020

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)