



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 30, 2012

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2012-06158

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 456305 (COSA File No. W006576).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a traffic accident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the information you submitted.

We note the submitted information includes a CR-3 crash report that was completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential.¹ *See id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of an accident report to a person who provides two of the following three items of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute.

¹Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. This office will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.007, .352; Open Records Decision No. 674 at 3 n.4 (2001) (mandatory exceptions).

Id. We note the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act are generally not applicable to information another statute makes public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989).

In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with the three specified items of information. Therefore, the department must release the CR-3 crash report to this requestor in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.091 provides in part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), emergency medical services (“EMS”) records are deemed confidential and may be released only in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health & Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091, .094.

Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we have marked, constitutes records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by EMS personnel. Thus, the marked information constitutes EMS records that are subject to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. We note, however, records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf for the release of confidential information.” *Id.* §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Section 773.093 provides a consent for release of EMS records must specify (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. You do not inform us the requestor has provided the department with any information indicating that an exception under section 773.092 would apply. *See id.* § 773.092. Thus, if the department receives the required consent, the EMS records of the requestor’s client must be released pursuant to sections 773.092 and 773.093 of the Health and Safety Code. If the department does not receive the required consent for release, then except for any information subject to

section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the marked EMS records must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code.

Next, we address your claim under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining information at issue. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state release of the remaining information would interfere with an open criminal case. Based on your representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the remaining information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, we note the remaining information includes a statutory warning and a notice of suspension, which we have marked. Because copies of those documents are provided to the person who is the subject of the warning and the notice, we find release of the statutory warning and the notice of suspension will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the statutory warning and the notice of suspension may not be withheld under section 552.108.

We also note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page offense and arrest information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. The department must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Except for basic information, the statutory warning, and the notice of suspension, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Lastly, we note the statutory warning and the notice of suspension contain a driver’s license number. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the driver’s license number we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the crash report pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. If the department receives the required consent, then the department must release the EMS records of the requestor's client pursuant to sections 773.092 and 773.093 of the Health and Safety Code. If the department does not receive the required consent, then, except for the information subject to section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, the department must withhold the marked EMS records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. Except for the statutory warning, the notice of suspension, and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information, including the information subject to section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the statutory warning and notice of suspension, the department must withhold the driver's license number we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Basic information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 456305

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)