



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 6, 2012

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
4616 Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2012-10400

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 458178.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information relating to a deceased inmate. You state some of the requested information will be released, including the custodial death report. *See* Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.18(b). You also state you will redact certain information subject to section 552.117 pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) and section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) authorizes the department to withhold the present and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of its current or former employees under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it was created after the date the request was received. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Medical records are confidential under the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). This office has also determined when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

The responsive information includes medical records subject to the MPA, which we have marked. We note this information pertains to a deceased individual. Medical records pertaining to a deceased patient may only be released upon the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See* Occ. Code § 159.005(a)(5). The consent must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* §§ 159.004, .005.

Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We note in governing access to a specific subset of information, the MPA prevails over the more general provisions of the Act. *See* ORD 598. Accordingly, the marked medical records may be released only in accordance with the MPA. *See id.*

You claim the remaining information is excepted under section 552.134(a) of the Government Code, which relates to inmates of the department and provides:

Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029, which provides, in relevant part:

[n]otwithstanding [s]ection . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Upon review of the remaining records in Exhibit C, we conclude section 552.134(a) is generally applicable to this information. We note, however, the remaining records pertain to an inmate's death in custody. Therefore, you must release basic information about the inmate's death pursuant to section 552.029. Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident. Therefore, with the exception of basic information, you must withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.134 of the Government Code.²

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure. We note basic information under section 552.029(8) corresponds to the basic front-page information that may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-88 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976).

We note the requestor, as consul general of the Consulado General De Mexico En Dallas, asserts a right of access to the submitted information under article 36 of the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations. Although article 36 grants consular officers the right to communicate and visit with nationals of the sending state, including those who are in prison or custody or have been detained, it does not grant consular officers access to confidential records of our state. Therefore, the department may only release the marked medical records in accordance with the MPA and must withhold the rest of the submitted information in Exhibit C under section 552.134 of the Government Code, except for basic information under section 552.029 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Charles Galindo Jr.
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CG/bs

Ref: ID# 458178

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)