



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 28, 2012

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283

OR2012-13612

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 463531 (COSA File No. W008067).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for all information regarding a specified car accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). You state the department received the initial request for information on June 6, 2012. You do not inform us the department was closed for any business days between June 6, 2012, and June 20, 2012. Accordingly, you were required to provide the information required by section 552.301(b) by June 20, 2012. However, the envelope in which the department provided the information required by subsection 552.301(b) was postmarked June 21, 2012. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *Id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although you seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interest and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, in failing to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its argument under section 552.108 and may not withhold the submitted information on that basis. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure under section 552.302, we will address the applicability of those sections to the submitted information.¹

Next, we note the submitted documents include a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with the requisite pieces of information. Accordingly, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement with the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681–82. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted video constitutes information that is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note the submitted information includes the requestor's insured's motor vehicle information, which the department would be required to withhold from the general public under section 552.130 of the Government Code and that may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.130. *See id.* Because section 552.130 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her insured's motor vehicle information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access to information that relates to a person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interest); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the submitted documents, which pertain to other individuals, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold any discernable license plate numbers not belonging to the requestor's insured from the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold: (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code; (2) the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (3) the information we have marked in the submitted documents, and any discernable license plate numbers in the submitted photographs, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

²We note the information to be released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023; ORD 481. Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office. We also note the information to be released contains social security numbers for which the requestor does not have a right of access. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Kathryn R. Mattingly". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the typed name.

Kathryn R. Mattingly
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KRM/bhf

Ref: ID# 463531

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)