



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 5, 2012

Ms. Lee Ann Rimer
Police Legal Advisor
City of Odessa Police Department
205 North Grant
Odessa, Texas 79761

OR2012-19527

Dear Ms. Rimer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 474124.

The Odessa Police Department (the "department") received a request for the personnel file of four named officers. You state the department has released most of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.102 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82.

The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. The information at issue pertains to department employees. As this office has stated on many occasions, the

public generally has a legitimate interest in public employment and public employees, particularly those who are involved in law enforcement. *See* Open Records Decision No. 444 at 6 (1986) (public has genuine interest in information concerning law enforcement employee's qualifications and performance and circumstances of his termination or resignation); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwanted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). We understand you to assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers, Inc.*, 652 S.W.2d 546, 549-51 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the Third Court of Appeals ruled the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court expressly disagreed with *Hubert's* interpretation of section 552.102(a) and held its privacy standard differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. *See Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 342 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court then considered the applicability of section 552.102, and held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *See id.* at 346.

Having carefully reviewed the information at issue, we have marked the information that the department must withhold under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The remaining information is not excepted under section 552.102(a) and may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.¹ *See id.* § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). The department must withhold the driver's license and motor vehicle information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked (1) under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code and (2) under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 474124

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)