



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 8, 2013

Ms. Evelyn W. Njuguna
Houston Police Department Staff Attorney
City of Houston
1200 Travis
Houston, Texas 77002-6000

OR2013-02275

Dear Ms. Njuguna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 478465 (HPD OR No. 12-6747).

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for dash-camera footage, police car audio recordings, 9-1-1 audio recordings and transcripts, and photographs related to a specified motor vehicle collision. You state the department will release the requested 9-1-1 audio recordings and transcripts. You further state the department has no information responsive to the requested dash-camera footage.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department has not complied with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Governmental Code in requesting this ruling. See Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. See *id.* § 552.301; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make

¹We note the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dism'd); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986).

compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). This office has held a compelling reason exists to withhold information when the information is confidential by law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider your argument regarding this exception.

Next, we note you have not submitted information related to the requested police car audio recordings. To the extent information related to the requested police car audio recordings existed and was maintained by the department on the date the department received the request, we assume you have released it. If you have not released such information, you must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(b) The department shall maintain an investigatory file that relates to a disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer that was overturned on appeal, or any document in the possession of the department that relates to a charge of misconduct against a fire fighter or police officer, regardless of whether the charge is sustained, only in a file created by the department for the department's use. The department may only release information in those investigatory files or documents relating to a charge of misconduct:

- (1) to another law enforcement agency or fire department;
- (2) to the office of a district or United States attorney; or
- (3) in accordance with Subsection (c).

(c) The department head or the department head's designee may forward a document that relates to disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer to the director or the director's designee for inclusion in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file maintained under Sections 143.089(a)-(f) only if:

- (1) disciplinary action was actually taken against the fire fighter or police officer;
- (2) the document shows the disciplinary action taken; and

(3) the document includes at least a brief summary of the facts on which the disciplinary action was based.

Local Gov't Code § 143.1214(b)-(c). You state Exhibit 2 consists of records of an internal investigation of alleged misconduct on the part of a department police officer. You inform us the investigation is pending and no disciplinary action has been taken. You state the information does not meet the requirements of section 143.1214(c) for inclusion in the police officer's civil service personnel file. *See id.* § 143.1214(c); *see also id.* § 143.089(a)-(g). You explain the information at issue is maintained in the department's investigatory files. You state the requestor is not a representative of another law enforcement agency, a fire department, or the office of a district or United States attorney. *See id.* § 143.1214(b)(1)-(2). Based on your representations and our review, we agree Exhibit 2 is confidential under section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/tch

Ref: ID# 478465

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

