



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 28, 2013

Ms. Karon Newby-Cooley
Records Clerk
Central Records Division
Pflugerville Police Department
P.O. Box 679
Pflugerville, Texas 78691

OR2013-03449

Dear Ms. Newby-Cooley:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 480662.

The Pflugerville Police Department (the "department") received a request for information regarding two specified case numbers. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have redacted portions of the submitted information. Pursuant to section 552.301 of the Government Code, a governmental body that seeks to withhold requested information must submit to this office a copy of the information, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the copy, unless the governmental body has received a previous determination for the information at issue. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (e)(1)(D). You do not assert, nor does our review of our records indicate, the department has been authorized to withhold the redacted information without seeking a ruling from this office. *Id.* § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2000). As such, this information must be submitted in a manner that enables this office to determine whether the information comes within the scope of an exception to disclosure. In this instance, we can discern the nature of the redacted information; thus, being deprived of that information

does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling. In the future, however, the department should refrain from redacting any information it is not authorized to withhold in seeking an open records ruling. Failure to do so may result in the presumption the redacted information is public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Fam. Code § 51.03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). Section 58.007 provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” is a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find case number 12090314 involves a child engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, case number 12090314 is subject to section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, the requestor is the parent of the juvenile offender. As such, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning her child pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information submitted in Exhibit C was used or developed in an investigation by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261). We also find Exhibit B contains a report of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect and information developed in an investigation by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. You have not indicated the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Accordingly, the information we have marked is confidential under section 261.201

of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We note that because section 261.201(a) protects all “files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers” relating to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse, the department must not release front-page information in such cases.

The remaining information contains motor vehicle information and a personal e-mail address. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note the remaining information includes the motor vehicle information of the requestor’s minor daughter, which the department would be required to withhold from the general public under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, because section 552.130 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her minor daughter’s motor vehicle information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (person or person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person’s privacy interests; Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Therefore, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the owner of the e-mail address consents to its release or the e-mail address falls within the scope of section 552.137(c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code, the motor vehicle information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and the personal e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to the e-mail's public disclosure.³ The remaining information must be released.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kathryn R. Mattingly
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KRM/bhf

Ref: ID# 480662

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold specific categories of information, including a Texas license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code and an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁴We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. Therefore, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.