



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 12, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-04167

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 481031.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information concerning a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct by a child that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). *See also id.* § 51.02(2) (defining "child" as a person who is ten years of age or older and younger than seventeen years of age). The submitted information involves delinquent conduct by a child occurring after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). Therefore, the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c).

In this instance, however, the requestor is identified as a parent of the child offender. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, the department may raise additional exceptions to disclosure. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which states:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Id. § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). The submitted information consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code and is confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of ch. 261 of Fam. Code); *see also id.* (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201).

In this instance, however, the submitted information indicates that the requestor, who is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect, is a parent of the child victims listed in the report. *See id.* § 261.201(k). Therefore, the department may not withhold from this requestor information concerning the alleged abuse that would otherwise be confidential under section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Nevertheless, the department may raise additional exceptions to disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). As you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as well as section 552.108 of the Government Code, we will consider those arguments as they apply to this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681–82.

The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). However, a governmental body is required to withhold an entire report when identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information or when the requestor knows the identity of the alleged sexual assault victim. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 393, 339; *see also* ORD 440 (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld).

You state the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victims listed in the information at issue. However, as a parent of the child victims, the requestor has a right of access to information the department would be required to withhold from the public to protect the children's privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, we conclude the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part, the following:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) it is information that the deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the exception it claims is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

We understand the information at issue relates to a concluded investigation which you state did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation and our review, we find the submitted information relates to a criminal case that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication.

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-88 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Basic information must be released even if it does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976)* (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

¹We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released. *See Fam. Code* §§ 58.007(e), 261.201(k); Gov't Code § 552.023. Therefore, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from our office.

responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 481031

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)