



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 25, 2013

Ms. Molly Cost
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2013-04821

Dear Ms. Cost:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 483067 (DPS PIR# 13-0356).

The Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") received a request for information related to a specified incident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you acknowledge, and we agree, DPS failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301(b) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption

¹Although you do not raise sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 in your brief, we understand you to raise these exceptions based on your markings.

of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The presumption that information is public under section 552.302 can be overcome by demonstrating the information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982).

DPS raises section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Nevertheless, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). In this instance, DPS states the Smith County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue. Accordingly, we will consider whether DPS may withhold the information at issue on behalf of the district attorney's office under section 552.108. Furthermore, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime ... if ... release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal prosecution and that the district attorney's office has requested the information not be released. Based on this representation and our review of the information, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court describes law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable and DPS may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code. Section 411.083 pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information

Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that DPS maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Upon review, we find the information you have marked consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, DPS must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country;
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Accordingly, DPS must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, DPS may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108 of the Government Code. DPS must withhold: (1) the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code, and (2) the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

²We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security information from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Eamon D. Briggs
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EDB/eb

Ref: ID# 483067

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)