



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 26, 2013

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2013-04892

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 482218 (COSA File Nos. W012319 and W013442).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request from two requestors for two specified offense reports. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's procedural obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). The submitted information shows, and in separate correspondence you indicate, the first request for information was received on December 20, 2012. Thus, the city's ten-business-day deadline to request a ruling was January 14, 2013. The envelope in which the city submitted its request for a ruling bears a meter mark of January 15, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Therefore, the city failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a

compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). We note section 552.108 of the Government Code is discretionary in nature. This exception serves only to protect a governmental body's interests, and may be waived; as such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.108. However, section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information. Therefore, we will address the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Section 58.007 reads in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of Fam.

Code § 58.007). Therefore, the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, one of the requestors in this instance is with the San Antonio Housing Authority (the "housing authority"). The federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996 authorizes housing authorities to obtain criminal records of applicants and tenants. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of chapter 42 of the United States Code provides, "Notwithstanding any other provision of law, . . . the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, covered housing assistance for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction." 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(C) provides, "[a] law enforcement agency described in subparagraph (A) shall provide information under this paragraph relating to any criminal conviction of a juvenile only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality." *Id.* § 1437d(q)(1)(C). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive criminal history record information ("CHRI"). ORD 655 at 4. CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). The Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") is required to provide CHRI to a noncriminal justice agency authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order, or state statute. Gov't Code § 411.083(b)(2). However, federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. The federal law provides, among other things, (1) public housing agencies may receive CHRI of adult and juvenile applicants or tenants of public housing, and (2) CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A); ORD 655 at 3-5. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law." 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Based on this language, we find section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over sections 58.007(c) and 261.201 of the Family Code, as well as section 552.108 of the Government Code. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm'n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). However, as previously discussed, section 1437d(q)(1)(C) allows a housing authority to obtain access to juvenile CHRI "only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality." 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(C). Juvenile justice information is confidential but may be released to "any entity to which [the DPS] may grant access to adult criminal records as provided by section 411.083 of the Government Code." Fam. Code § 58.106(a)(2). Section 411.083(b)(2) of the Government Code states that DPS is required to provide CHRI to a non-criminal justice agency authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to federal statute, executive order, or state statute. Gov't Code § 411.083(b)(2). Because housing authorities are authorized to obtain adult CHRI under sections 1437d(q)(1)(A) and 411.083(b)(2), they are also authorized to obtain similar

information regarding juveniles. The housing authority, however, may obtain and use juvenile information only in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1)(A). *See also id.* § 411.084(2)(B) (stating CHRI may only be disclosed or used as authorized or directed by another statute).

In this instance, we are unable to determine if one of the requestors is seeking the release of CHRI of applicants or tenants for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction. Consequently, if the information at issue pertains to an applicant or tenant of public housing and the requestor at issue intends to use the CHRI for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, we conclude the city must release information to this requestor that shows the types of allegations made and whether there were arrests, informations, indictments, detentions, convictions, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the city must withhold the remaining information from this requestor, and the entirety of the information from the other requestor, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, if the city determines the information at issue does not pertain to an applicant or tenant of public housing or the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI in the information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then the city must withhold the submitted information in its entirety from both requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Fabian
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BF/tch

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Ref: ID# 482218

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Two Requestors
(w/o enclosures)

