



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

March 26, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-04923

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 482106.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address involving the requestor and a named individual for a specified period of time. You state you have released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request because it does not involve the requestor or the named individual. The department need not release non-responsive information in response to this request, and this ruling will not address that information.

Next, we note you seek to withhold the addresses and telephone numbers of 9-1-1 callers. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708 (2003), this office issued a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this

office. See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Therefore, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the originating address or telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. See *id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert report numbers 10-339217 and 08-264109 relate to cases that concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531

S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 10-339217 and 08-264109 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, title, or registration, issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, in addition to the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Lastly, we note you have marked the requestor's social security number within the submitted information. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b). However, because section 552.147 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her own social security number under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Accordingly, the department may not withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the originating address or telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 10-339217 and 08-264109 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, in addition to the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free,

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Paige Lay".

Paige Lay  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PL/bhf

Ref: ID# 482106

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)