



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 27, 2013

Ms. Rachel L. Lindsay
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2013-04992

Dear Ms. Lindsay:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 482521 (PIR# 32-13).

The Town of Flower Mound (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for a specified incident report. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the incident. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). We have reviewed the submitted information and find it involves allegations of juvenile conduct in violation of a penal statute that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). We note, however, the requestor is a parent of one of the juvenile offenders listed in the report. Therefore, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning his juvenile child pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Section 58.007(j) provides, however, that any personally identifiable information concerning other juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). Section 58.007(j) further provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state release of the submitted information would interfere with a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representations, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the submitted information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. Town of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975)(court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, (Tex. 1976).

We note, however, section 552.108 of the Government Code does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). The department must release basic information, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the town may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

The town also claims the basic information is subject to the doctrine of common-law privacy, which also is encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the town may not withhold any portion of the basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the town may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, the department may not release as basic information any personally identifiable

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument under section 552.136.

information concerning any juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness other than the juvenile offender to whom the requestor is a parent.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/ag

Ref: ID# 482521

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the requestor has a special right of access under section 58.007(e) of the Family Code to the basic information being released in this instance. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the town receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the town must again seek a ruling from this office.