



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 28, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-05016

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 482495.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified case number. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Section 58.007(c) does not apply to law enforcement records that relate to a juvenile only as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party; rather the juvenile must be involved as a suspect, offender, or defendant. *See id.* § 58.007(c). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not involve a juvenile identified as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Thus, you have failed to demonstrate how the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part the following:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal

representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Id. § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information consists of a report used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse,” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also* Fam. Code § 101.003(a) (defining child for purposes of ch. 261). Accordingly, we determine the submitted report is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, the requestor is a parent of some of the child victims listed in the report and is not alleged to have committed the alleged or suspected abuse. Therefore, the submitted report may not be withheld from this requestor on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states that any information excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). You assert the submitted report is excepted from public disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, we address your arguments for the report.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

We note the information at issue includes a statutory warning, form DIC-24, and a notice of suspension, form DIC-25. Because copies of those forms were provided to the person who is the subject of the warning and the notice, we find release of the statutory warning and notice of suspension will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold the statutory warning or notice of suspension under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

You state release of the remaining information would interfere with a pending criminal investigation and/or prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531

S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes the identity of the complainant but does not include the identity of a witness or victim, unless the victim is also the complainant. See ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the statutory warning, and the notice of suspension, the department may withhold the submitted report under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We next note the statutory warning and notice of suspension contain the arrested person’s driver’s license number. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.¹ See Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the driver’s license number we have marked in the statutory warning and the notice of suspension under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Finally, we understand the department to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the remaining information. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of this test must be satisfied. See *id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is private. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, except for the statutory warning, the notice of suspension, and basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing basic information, the statutory warning, and the notice of suspension, the department must withhold the marked driver's license number under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/tch

Ref: ID# 482495

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released in this instance. See Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.