



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 9, 2013

Ms. Hadassah Schloss
Open Records Coordinator
Texas General Land Office
P. O. Box 12873
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2013-05645

Dear Ms. Schloss:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 483640.

The Texas General Land Office (the "GLO") received a request for all records, including but not limited to applications and permits, with regard to PC1149. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. You state you have notified the deceased individual's family of their right to submit comments. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information

relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. However, the common-law right to privacy is a personal right that “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded.” *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters. Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145 (N.D. Tex. 1979); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Thus, information pertaining solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, we find the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the constitutional right to privacy. Constitutional privacy protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S.589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the “zones of privacy,” pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. *See Fajjo v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7 (1987). The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir.1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. *See* ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492). However, as noted above, the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and therefore may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; ORD 272 at 1 (privacy rights lapse upon death). However, the United States Supreme Court has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. *See Nat’l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 124 S. Ct. 1570 (2004). You state you have notified the deceased individual’s family of the request for information and of their right to assert a privacy interest in the information at issue. As of the date of this decision, we have not received any correspondence from the deceased individual’s family. Thus, we have no basis for determining the family’s privacy interest in the submitted information. Therefore, this information may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. As no further exceptions to disclosure are raised, the GLO must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Thana Hussaini', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Thana Hussaini
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TH/som

Ref: ID# 483640

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)