



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 17, 2013

Ms. Erin A. Higginbotham
For the City of Pflugerville
Denton, Navarro, Rocha & Bernal, P.C.
2500 West William Cannon Drive, Suite 609
Austin, Texas 78745

OR2013-08285

Dear Ms. Higginbotham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 487637.

The Pflugerville Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for the following categories of information: (1) the personnel file of a specified department officer, (2) any and all complaints, concerns, allegations or grievances against the officer, (3) department policies governing internal affairs and/or CID investigations of department personnel, and (4) copies of any and all documentation being relied upon to support the allegations which form the basis for a specified investigation. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request because it was created after the date the request was received. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the

detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to the records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and that does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). You state the submitted information relates to a pending internal affairs investigation of the officer in question. However, you represent to this office that “the pending investigation also involves the investigation of a crime, namely assault.” Based on your representation and our review, we find release of Exhibits D1, D8, and D9 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, you may withhold Exhibits D1, D8, and D9 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, we note the information in Exhibits D2 through D7 pertain to two separate unrelated incidents. You do not provide any arguments explaining that these two submitted incidents are pending with the department. Thus, you have failed to explain how release of Exhibits D2 through D7 would interfere with the department’s investigation of its assault case. We find you have not sufficiently demonstrated any of the information in Exhibits D2 through D7 fall within the scope of subsection 552.108(a)(1). We therefore conclude the department may not withhold Exhibits D2 through D7 under section 552.108.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. Therefore, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibits D1, D8, and D9 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”¹ Gov’t Code § 552.101.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Fam. Code § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). Section 58.007 provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” is a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find that a portion of Exhibit D7 involves children engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions to confidentiality under section 58.007 apply in this instance. Therefore, we find that the information we have marked in Exhibit D7 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990)*. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government

Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the information we have marked in Exhibit D7 consists of CHRI the department must withhold from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

We note portions of the submitted information are subject to the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by the MPA. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in relevant part the following:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information constitute information obtained from medical records. Accordingly, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses constitutional privacy, which protects two kinds of interests. See *Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions relating to the “zones of privacy” pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education the United States Supreme Court has recognized. See *Fadjo v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. See *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. See ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs” and the scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy. *Id.* at 5 (internal quotations omitted) (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

Federal courts have recognized individuals have a constitutional right to privacy in their unclothed bodies. Quoting the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, which concluded, “[w]e cannot conceive of a more basic subject of privacy than the naked body[.]” the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit has found “there is a right to privacy in one’s unclothed or partially unclothed body, regardless [of] whether that right is established through the auspices of the Fourth Amendment or the Fourteenth Amendment.” *Poe v. Leonard*, 282 F.3d 123, 138-39 (2d Cir. 2002) (quoting *York v. Story*, 324 F.2d 450, 455 (9th Cir. 1963)). We note some of the submitted videos in Exhibits D2, D4, D5, and D6, as well as photographs in Exhibit D7, depict the unclothed or partially unclothed body of an individual involved in the incident. To the extent the submitted videos contain images of the unclothed or partially unclothed body, those portions must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. We have indicated the videos that contain images of a person’s unclothed or partially unclothed body.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. Common-law privacy protects the types of information held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. See *id.* at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. Cf. *U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records

found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Additionally, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Furthermore, this office has also held common-law privacy protects the identifying information of juvenile offenders. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); cf. Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Upon review, we find the information we have marked and indicated on the submitted videos is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, this information must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information that we have marked in Exhibit D7 under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibits D1, D8, and D9 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With respect to Exhibits D2 through D7, the department must withhold: (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code; (2) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law; (3) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA; (4) the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy; (5) the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (6) the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²We note basic information includes the social security number of an arrestee. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Britni Fabian". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Britni Fabian
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BF/dls

Ref: ID# 487637

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)