



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 18, 2013

Ms. Teresa Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2013-10290

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 490895 (ORR #MAYR032713).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified address during a specified period of time and information related to six named individuals during a specified period of time.¹ You state you have released some of the requested information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130 and 552.137 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.³

¹We note the department received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request).

²Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this section based on your markings in the submitted documents.

³We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, seeks all reports pertaining to six named individuals. This aspect of the request requires the department to compile the named individuals' criminal histories and implicates the privacy of each of the named individuals. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing any of the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note you have submitted documents that do not list any of the named individuals as the suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant for that report or that relate to the address specified by the requestor. This information is not part of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal histories, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

We note portions of the information at issue are subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test noted above. *See Idus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 455* (1987) (information pertaining to prescription drugs, specific illnesses, operations and procedures, and physical disabilities protected from disclosure), 422 (1984), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing

and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how the remaining information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the remaining information you have marked may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the constitutional right to privacy, which protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the “zones of privacy,” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *See Fado v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); *see also* ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); *see also* ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. *See* ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492). Upon review, we find no portion of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Consequently, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy

Some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code.⁴ Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Act of May 26, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., H.B. 1632, § 3 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 552.1175). Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to “peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.1175(a)(1). Some of the remaining information relates to an individual who was a licensed as peace officer of another law enforcement agency at the time the information at issue was created. However, we are unable to determine from the information provided if the individual at issue is currently a licensed peace officer. Thus, we must rule conditionally. Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue, which we have marked, relates to an individual who is currently licensed as a peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the marked information under

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Conversely, if the individual whose information is at issue is not currently licensed as a peace officer or does not elect to restrict access to her information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the marked information may not be withheld under section 552.1175..

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of motor vehicle record information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the department must withhold the personal e-mail address you have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.⁵

In summary, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing any of the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information we have marked relates to an individual who is currently licensed as a peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the personal e-mail address you have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure. The remaining information must be released.⁶

⁵We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁶We note the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See Gov't Code* § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "N. A. Ybarra".

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/ac

Ref: ID# 490895

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)