



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 27, 2013

Mr. John R. Batoon
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-10929

Dear Mr. Batoon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 491915.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified offense report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(b). In this instance, you state the department received the request for information on April 2, 2013, and inform us the department was closed for business on April 5, 2013, and April 12, 2013. Accordingly, you were required to provide the information required by subsection 552.301(b) by April 18, 2013. However, the envelope in which the department provided the information required by subsection 552.301(b) was postmarked April 23, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Because the department did not submit the information required by section 552.301(b) within the required time period, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption

the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Forth Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-81 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The presumption that information is public under section 552.302 can generally be overcome by demonstrating the information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). You claim an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is discretionary and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108. However, you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code, which can provide a compelling reason to withhold information. Thus, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides in part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential

under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). You contend the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201. We find the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to be generally confidential under section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of section 22.011 as “a person younger than 17 years of age”). In this instance, however, the requestor is a parent of the child who was the victim of the alleged or suspected abuse and is not accused of committing the abuse. Therefore, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Section 261.201(l)(2) provides, however, any information excepted from disclosure under the Act or other law must be withheld. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Therefore, we will address your remaining argument under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c), which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are

separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information consists of a law enforcement record that involves alleged juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 of the Family Code apply. Therefore, we find the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/tch

Ref: ID# 491915

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)