



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 3, 2013

Ms. Donna L. Johnson  
Counsel for Manvel Police Department  
Olson & Olson, L.L.P.  
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600  
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2013-11341

Dear Ms. Johnson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 492101 (Manvel Ref. COM13-006).

The Manvel Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual, including information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. Additionally, we have considered comments from an interested third party. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested third party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy

interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must generally withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the requestor also seeks information pertaining to a specified incident; thus, this portion of the request does not require the department to compile an individual's criminal history and does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. Therefore, we will address your remaining arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue relates to a criminal case that is pending investigation by the department and prosecution by the Brazoria County District Attorney's Office. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing the types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense and arrest

information, the department may generally withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1).<sup>1</sup>

However, we must address whether the requestor has a right of access to the requested information. In this instance, the requestor is an investigator for the Texas Education Agency (the "TEA"), which has assumed the duties of the State Board for Educator Certification (the "SBEC").<sup>2</sup> Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides the SBEC "may obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information ["CHRI"] and all records contained in any closed criminal investigation file that relate to a specific applicant for or holder of a certificate issued under Subchapter B, Chapter 21 [of the Education Code]." Educ. Code § 22.082. Section 411.090 of the Government Code grants the SBEC a right of access to obtain CHRI from the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") regarding persons who have applied to the SBEC. *See* Gov't Code § 411.090. Additionally, section 411.0901 of the Government Code specifically provides the TEA with a right of access to obtain CHRI maintained by the DPS regarding certain school employees or applicants for employment. *See id.* § 411.0901. Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS also is authorized to "obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that [agency]." *Id.* § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, information, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2).

We find, when read together, sections 22.082 of the Education Code and 411.087 of the Government Code give TEA a statutory right of access to portions of the information at issue. *Cf. Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined). Thus, we conclude the department must release to this requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Center Point Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *Collins v. Tex. Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under Act).

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments, except to note that basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* does not include information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

<sup>2</sup>The 79th Texas Legislature passed House Bill 1116, which required the transfer of the SBEC's administrative functions and services to the TEA, effective September 1, 2005.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records other than the specified incident depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information pertaining to the specified incident under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup> The department must release information from the submitted documents that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to section 22.082 of the Education Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lindsay E. Hale  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LEH/tch

Ref: ID# 492101

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the basic information being released includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).