



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 19, 2013

Mr. Warren M. S. Ernst
Chief of the General Counsel Division
Office of the City Attorney
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street, Room 7DN
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2013-16282

Dear Mr. Ernst:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 499796 (Request No. 1307).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for copies of employee performance appraisals and acknowledgment signature pages for all employees of the city's controller's office for the 2011-2012 fiscal year. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

We note the submitted information consists of completed evaluations subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(1) provides for required public disclosure of "a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body[,]" unless the information is made confidential under this chapter or other law or is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the submitted information, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.)

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 (1999) (governmental body may waive section 552.103). As such, section 552.103 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. You also raise section 552.136 of the Government Code for portions of the submitted information. Because section 552.136 makes information confidential under the Act, we will address its applicability to the submitted information.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). You state the employee identification numbers you have highlighted are used in conjunction with one additional digit to access the employees’ credit union bank accounts. We therefore conclude the city must withhold the employee identification numbers you have highlighted in the information at issue under section 552.136 of the Government Code.² The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Fabian
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BF/bhf

²We note section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

Mr. Warren M.S. Ernst - Page 3

Ref: ID# 499796

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)